























Paul Moses' The Saint and the Sultan discussion prompts

- 1. What do you think of Moses' assertion that Francis' peace was "transcendent," it was not that of "stopping war" or the anti-war movements but a "new era of reconciliation ... creating God's kingdom on earth"; "the broader peace that Francis preached [was] about changing relationships" (235), rooted in practicing Jesus' "table fellowship" (146)?
- 2. Do you think it would be advisable to emphasize ways people live religious values rather than focusing on religious teachings? (Recall ways Francis' Christianity paralleled Sufis, e.g., dwelling on scriptures that emphasized God's transforming love and presence in the world, rejecting worldliness in favor of ascetic poverty, repentance, and fasting. [138-139])
- 3. Were you struck by parallels Moses observed between the Iraq war and the 5th Crusade?
 - a. Both were sold to the public as preemptive wars (231).
 - b. Inspection reports and intelligence data were ignored (231).
 - c. Leaders failed to heed potential consequences of war because of "ideological fervor" (231).
 - d. Demonization of "the enemy" was pervasive (231).
 - e. Debates with religious leaders about what constitutes a just war were ignored (232).
- 4. What do you think about Moses' assertion: "Anyone seeking an answer to the question, "What would Jesus do?' would be better advised to look to Francis than to the Christian leaders in the United States who supported the decision to go to war" (234)?
- 5. Is there any warrant for radical non-violence in Islam? Would pacifism be a rejection of the obligation of Jihad ("exertion") in service of those oppressed, especially for their dedication to God's will (see Surah 9)? (Francis wrote, "... our friends are those who for no reason cause us trouble and suffering, shame or injury, pain or torture, even martyrdom and death. It is these we must love, and love very much ..." [134].)
- 6. Was Francis right that Christians should "be subject" to Muslims (178)? How should that apply today? [Is there something inherently unfair in non-Muslim minorities being designated *dhimmis* {"protected"} and their adult males required to pay the *jizyah* {per capita tax}?]
- 7. Do you agree with Mahmoud Abyoub that the story of Francis and the Sultan should remind Muslims and Christians of the Qur'anic and traditional Islamic reverence for Christian holiness (234)? (Do Christians have reverence for Islamic holiness?)
- 8. How should Muslims and Jews react to the statement: "Malik al-Kamil is giving to Christianity a lesson in dialogue, in tolerance" Rev. Mamdouh Shehab (236)?
- 9. What is your reaction to the statement by Moses: "Both sides have played the aggressor in the long history of conflict between Christians and Muslims, and both have resorted to 'holy' wars" (237)?

- 10. Discuss some of the suggestions Moses put forward as helpful to keep in mind when Muslims and Christians encounter one another e.g., establish interreligious dialogue (141); treat each other as friends (141); dwell on common elements, without criticism (141); celebrate small "miracles" in establishing peace (144); show respect and love (146, 176); share table fellowship (146-47); discern when to speak and when to be silent, especially avoid "preaching" when others are suffering (151, 164); be "subject to" others; be models of peace, not disputation and living in peace, avoiding quarrels and disputes, and leading by example. (164, 178); show humane concern, be courteous, and generous (174); respond lavishly to complaints (174); live with each other in the same community and culture (223); stress the importance of dialogue and working together over conversion (226); reflect together in order to continually recover common, shared values (227); take up individual initiatives, not leaving the effort to government officials. (231)
- 11. Do you accept Moses' characterization and valuation of Bonaventure's depiction of the meeting between the sultan and the saint as "theological"?
- 12. What is your take on Moses' view of Francis and martyrdom (note the references to the "trial by fire" [mubahala]: 208, 210, 212, 213, 214, 215)?
- 13. What impression do you have of Francis? How has Moses' depiction of Francis influenced the way you view the saint, e.g., that he had PTSD, that he was "a knight of nonviolence" with a keen sense of politics, that he was an angry and sad man?
- 14. Are you convinced that there is a disconnect between Francis' own writings, the biographers, and artistic presentations of Francis' meeting with the sultan?
- 15. Does Moses establish that Francis' peacemaking was born of his violence ("slaying" [22, 24]) in the war with Perugia? Does Moses go too far here? (In his writings, including the *Testament*, Francis does not mention killing: "While I was in sin, it seemed very bitter to me to see lepers.")
- 16. Were you convinced by Moses' argument about the source of Francis' "Praises of God," along with the meaning of the invocation and drawing associated with it (the little parchment that Francis gave to Leo at the end of his life [182])?

•

The following are notes for the questions (above):

Notes for Question 2.

Sultan Al-Kamil was likened to "a gracious father who saved the trapped Crusaders, visited them in their misery, heard their complaints, cared for their sick, and excelled all other noblemen with his wisdom." ... "The Sultan was moved by such compassion toward us that for many days he freely revived and refreshed our whole multitude. ... Who could doubt that such kindness, mildness and mercy proceeded from God?" ... "[Francis] would have seen God's hand behind the sultan's compassion. ... To Francis, such scenes would have harkened back to the ultimate tableaux of peace prophesied in the Book of Isaiah: lions grazing beside lambs ..." (175-176). ("Unfortunately, we have no record of how Francis responded to news of the Crusade's conclusion" [176.])

Notes for Question 5.

""The major religions are all vulnerable to the accusation that they have been used to advance violence rather than to prevent it. Francis' response was to go deeper into his own religious tradition than Pope Innocent and his corps of Crusade preachers did, retrieving Jesus' injunction to love enemies as the basis for his approach to Muslims" (234). "Sultan al-Kamil violated Muslim religious law through his willingness to listen to Francis, he in fact went deeper into his own religious tradition, retrieving the theme of respect for holy Christians" ... (234).

Notes for Question 10.

- a. Establish a 2-way conversation, an interreligious dialogue. "Sultan al-Kamil would no doubt have enjoyed [Francis'] style of preaching, but theirs was likely at least a two-way conversation rather than the solo performance the Christian chroniclers describe" (140). "The contemporary concept of interreligious dialogue didn't exist at the time, but this was nonetheless a dialogue a peaceful exchange of ideas about two competing religions" (141).
- b. Treat each other as friends. "Francis and the enemy soldiers were treating one another as friends" (141). "Sultan al-Kamil showed an extraordinary level of kindness to John of Brienne and the other hostages ... He threw a banquet for the war-weary Christian hostages and the churchmen and aristocrats taken prisoner two years earlier Sultan al-Kamil and John of Brienne became such great friends that some whispered that the Crusade leader who had risked his life time and again during the long battle was in collusion with the Muslims" (174).
- c. **Dwell on common elements, without criticism.** "Francis ... dwelled on subjects that Islam and Christianity have in common and avoided direct criticism of Muhammad or Islam" (141).
- d. **Celebrate authentic "miracles," small (?) movements toward establishing peace.** "Perhaps the hagiographers should have been content with the miracle that Francis and Suntan al-Kamil had found a way of talking peacefully in the middle of a gruesome war" (144).
- e. **Show respect and love.** "As time passed, Francis would reveal himself in writings and comments that reflected respect even love for the sultan" (146). "Francis, longing to return to the East, held the sultan deep within his heart" (176).

•

- f. Share in table fellowship. "This scene of Francis peacefully breaking bread at a banquet with Sultan Malik al-Kamil, his supposed enemy, could not differ more from the fictitious image that has come down through the ages to capture their encounter: two tense antagonists separated by a threatening bonfire. Their meal ought to have been the enduring image of the encounter between the saint and the sultan, painted in bright colors on cathedral walls" (146-147).
- g. Discern when to speak and when to be silent. Avoid "preaching" when others are suffering. "Although there was ample opportunity to preach to the Muslims who survived the siege of Damietta, Francis, shaken after seeing the devils of greed and violence seize control of men who had pledged themselves to the cross, wanted no part of it" (151). "Francis thought there were times when preaching the Christian message was *not* God's will. This indicates that a process of discernment an effort to determine God's will was required. The brothers were not to feel, as the 5 Moroccan martyrs apparently did, that the only acceptable course was to preach at all costs. Nor did Francis leave it to ecclesiastical authorities to decide the acceptable time for preaching. The individual missionary was to discern God's will through prayer or some sign" (164).
- h. Be "subject to" others; be models of peace, not disputation. Live in peace, avoid quarrels and disputes, and lead by example. "The heart of Francis's instruction for approaching Muslims followed: 'The brothers who go can conduct themselves among them spiritually in 2 ways. One way is to avoid quarrels or disputes and to be subject to every human creature for God's sake, so bearing witness to the fact that they are Christians. Another way is to proclaim the word of God openly ... that they may be baptized and become Christians" (163). "Proceed without violence of any kind and be willing to accept the consequences.... [G]o spiritually among the Muslims. ... Francis clearly wanted to send brothers out to live among the Muslims, not to die among them. In the end, Francis sought perseverance, not combativeness" (164). "Hugh leaves no doubt which of the 2 methods to "be subject" to Muslims and win them over through peaceful example, or to preach the Christian faith was to be preferred. He noted: "As the saint encouraged in the first Rule: 'Let all the brothers preach with their deeds'" (178).
- i. Show humane concern, be courteous, and be generous. "It was not unusual ... for aristocrats on both sides to treat one another with great courtesy. But al-Kamil distinguished himself by providing generously for the starving soldiers ... He sent them an ample bounty of bread, pomegranates, and melons. For 15 days Sultan al-Kamil fed the Christian army" (174).
- j. **Respond lavishly to complaints.** "[T]he Christians complained to al-Kamil. He insisted that the Christians be given masts. Al-Kamil also built a bridge over the Nile to speed up the Christina army's withdrawal" (174).
- k. "Interreligious dialogue is most effective when it springs from the experience of living with each other from day to day with in the same community and culture" (223). Pope John Paul II said this when he visited the Umayyad Great Mosque in Damascus in 2001.
- I. Stress the importance of dialogue and working together over conversion. "The minister general traced this idea back to a passage in Francis' *Rule* of 1223: 'I counsel, warn and exhort my Friars in the Lord Jesus Christ, that when they go about through the world, they are not to quarrel nor

- contend in words, nor are they to judge others, but they are to be meek, peaceable and modest, meek and humble, speaking uprightly to all, as is fitting'" (226).
- m. "Reflect together in order to continually recover common, shared values." The missionary was to be a 'promoter of dialogue' who worked 'with believers of other religions in a spirit of religious pluralism and sharing the common duty of building a better world with them" (227).
- n. "The road to peace is for all of us, not just the government officials who lead in our name." "Peace gets a chance when the divide between peoples is bridged through personal relationships" (231).

Notes for Question 11.

Moses argues: "While it may not be great history, Bonaventure's account of this scene serves a theological purpose. He depicted Francis as a new Elijah, a man of God who defeated the prophets of Baal by calling upon the Lord to ignite a fire beneath his sacrifice of a bull. The prophets of Baal, unable to do the same by calling on their pagan gods, were sent to their death after losing this competition with Elijah. That parallel appealed to Bonaventure who cast Francis as a new messenger of the word of God. But Francis offered a different path that eluded Bonaventure; he wanted to approach the sultan and his advisers as friends" (135).

Notes for Question 12.

- a. "While it is true that the Earlier Rule expected missionary brothers to be prepared to die, it was not a manual for self-destruction. Instead, it showed that Francis believed it was God's will that he and his friars embody Jesus' message to love the enemy. When a history of the 5 martyred brothers was brought to Francis, he mourned the friars' loss but forbade a pubic reading of the celebratory account" (164-165).
- b. "Francis grieved at the loss of these young men but had mixed feelings about their insistence on being martyred. While he valued their devotion, he knew that the brothers had confronted a Muslim ruler in a way he had avoided: they had approached an enemy more as provocateurs than as friends" (153).
- c. "The cardinal presented Francis as a man who obeyed Christ's will by confronting the Muslim foe, no matter how implacable. 'He longed so much to die for Christ that he went among infidels to preach the Christian faith and even to the cruel Sultan, in the hope of having to suffer for Christ,' the Cardinal said. 'But when the Sultan realized this, he refused to make him a martyr in order to deprive him of so great a glory' (207).
- d. "As the Fifth Crusade ended, the Crusaders had praised al-Kamil for his kindness. By the 1260s none of that history mattered any longer. Rome had spoken: the sultan was a cruel tyrant whom Francis approached to achieve martyrdom. And this is the story Bonaventure delivered the following year in *The Major Legend..."* (208) See the references to the "trial by fire" [mubahala]: 208, 210, 212, 213, 214, 215.
- e. "Francis's early biographers insisted that his interest in Muslim leaders reflected a holy death wish a 'burning desire for martyrdom' ... and not a plan for evangelization or for peace. ... [C]hroniclers

 		wa		NIII W. II	
	·				
				/	
•					
				·	
			-		
	·				٠
				·	
			•		
				•	
•					

- did not accept that one of the greatest Christian saints wanted to have civil discourse with Islam, the wolf outside the gate. This is not to say Francis opposed martyrdom; his *Earlier Rule* required that brothers who wanted to preach the Christian faith to Muslims be prepared to die" (51).
- f. [Celano] seems to have exaggerated the saint's desire for martyrdom. Francis returned home from Spain making excited plans for the future **not the thoughts of a man intent on martyrdom**. ... As Mahatma Gandhi wrote: 'Nonviolence cannot be taught to a person who fears to die.' This, however, is not the same as *wanting* to die" (55).
- g. "Francis understood the risks [of crossing the enemy line]. Having been traumatized by his earlier experiences as a soldier and prisoner of war in Perugia, he would have known that death or imprisonment were likely outcomes of his plan to cross enemy lines during wartime. But with Cardinal Pelagius once again rejecting peace, he decided there was no other choice" (122).
- h. "Severed heads were hurled and piled as a warning of the brutality to come. War had unleashed the demons. Francis knew there was a strong chance he could be killed" (124).
- i. "Did Francis want to die? ... Rev. Michael Cusato ... [wrote]: "He had a vision. Further **bloodshed was** not a part of it" (124).
- j. Hugh of Digne wrote of the *Rule*: "Because of the desire for martyrdom, one should not act precipitously but in fact prudently. For we should strive for the death of Christ and [yet] flee in an ordinate manner." Martyrdom was not to be courted; Hugh urged friars to be willing to sacrifice all for Christ but to be prudent as well by extricating themselves from a violent situation rather than seeking death" (124).

Notes for Question 13.

- a. Moses implies that Francis suffered from PTSD.
 - i. "Beyond his physical ailments, Francis was inevitably shadowed by psychological disturbance"
 (26).
 - ii. "The early accounts of Francis life don't provide enough detail for us to judge whether he would today meet the diagnostic criteria for PTSD. It is clear, however, that he was psychologically changed, and the early documents describe his gradual recovery" (32).
 - iii. "Prayer helped him to overcome the deep distress, **if not mental illness**, that stole away his inherent joie de vivre" (33).
 - iv. "Francis saw warfare as quite literally the devil's work... Celano wrote: 'He saw devils rejoicing over that place and stirring up the citizens to each other's destruction.' Deeply moved, he wanted to help, but 'was not able.' ... [H]e may well have been unable to move forward because of the crippling memories of his own war experience" (45).
- b. Moses presents Francis as "a knight of nonviolence" who had a keen sense of politics.
 - i. "Francis, a fool for God, was no fool when it came to reading the political climate" (39).
 - ii. "[T]he story [of knights] shows Francis to be a shrewd observer of the treacherous politics of his day. With insights honed by extended periods of contemplation, he drew on personal

•	•						
					·		*. #
•	•						
			•				
						•	
	÷ .						
			•				
				•			
						÷	
	•						
		•					
•			•				•
•							
				-			

- experience as a soldier and son of a well-connected merchant to read the signs of the times and foresee the violence in Perugia" (44).
- "By writing allegorically about the wolf [of Gubbio] instead of the hated and feared Muslims, the author of this fable was able to tell the story of Francis' desire for peace, free from the eyes of the inquisitors. It applied deliberately political language Francis negotiated a 'pact' between Gubbio and the wolf to a fable. Francis ... shunned the tools of the Crusader with one exception: the sign of the Cross. Francis, a knight of nonviolence, chose to free the world from its self-destructive behavior by calling or repentance and conversion. It was a radically different approach to dealing with the 'wolf' at Christendom's door" (49).
- iv. Moses asserts that Francis' concept of peace "was not limited to inner serenity or one-to-one interactions with people he met" (119). Moses argues that Celano's, and presumably Francis', criticism of the "princes of this world" shows that Francis' concept of peace was both prophetic and political. In reference to the 1219 battle, "Celano assailed the authorities for the carnage: 'Let the princes of the world know these things and let them know that it is not easy to fight against God, that is, against the will of the Lord." He didn't blame the foot soldiers who had denounced him, but he held the leaders responsible for the carnage (119). "The Christians' major political decisions in the Crusades were always preceded by the great prophetic question, Is God on our side? Francis declared that the answer was no. To weigh in, on one side or the other, even in religious terminology, was a political act. Francis wasn't finished. He had an idea to prevent yet another bloodbath. If the Crusade leaders would not seek peace, he would" (119).

c. Moses presents Francis as an angry man.

- i. "[Francis] cursed Philip as a destroyer of the Order.... Indeed, Brother Stephen said that he had heard Saint Francis pronounce these words: 'Until now the ulcer has been confined to the flesh and so there remained a hope for a cure; but now it has penetrated to the bone and it will surely be incurable.' Ailing and angry, disappointed by the evil of the Crusaders at Damietta and by the doings of his brothers in Italy, thwarted in his attempt to make peace by converting the sultan, Francis hastened home" (155).
- ii. Moses reports that Angelo Clareno stressed Francis's anger at changes in the order. He asserts that Francis wound up "cursing a highly respected brother and doctor of law" and "Francis was so angered that he refused to pardon the friar even years later, according to this account" (157).
- iii. When "the people of Assisi constructed a large house close to the Portiuncula, "Francis was outraged." During the chapter meeting Francis tried to destroy the tiled roof. "Trying to assuage the incensed Francis, they told him that the local government owned the house, not the order. Francis relented, having demonstrated his anger." (158)
- iv. "Angry, frustrated, and disappointed, Francis, who always had a knack for the dramatic, gave up his position as head of the Friars Minor." "His anger during this time was featured with particular prominence in some of the later accounts." (158)

- v. "The **heat of his anger continued to burn** in the chill of December, when Brother Stephen found that Francis had **not cooled off** about Philip's attempt to commandeer the cloistered Poor Ladies" (158). When Stephen went to one of Clare's monasteries on Brother Philip's order, "Francis was **outraged**; he had insisted that the brothers avoid any role in the Poor Ladies." (158-159)
- d. Moses presents Francis as a sad man. "Ill, shunted aside, and frazzled by his exposure to so much violence and death in Egypt, Francis suffered... He wrestled with 'a most serious temptation of the spirit,' a recurring sadness that Celano wrote left Francis 'filled with sorrows for several years.' Separating himself from the other brothers, he prayed and meditated, trying to overcome his gloominess" (159)

Notes for Question 14.

- a. The violence of the "colorful scene of Francis standing beside a blazing fire" and the proposed combat between Francis and the sultan "contradicts everything Francis wrote and said about loving his enemies, the bedrock of his conversion from soldier to preacher of peace and penitence. Francis, the former soldier, was drawn ... to a key verse in the Sermon on the Mount: 'But I say to you, love your enemies, and pray for those who persecute you.' He used it five times in the small collection of his known writings. He elaborated on it in his *Earlier Rule*, instructing: 'Remember the words of our Lord, Love your enemies, do good to those who hate you. Our Lord Jesus Christ himself, in whose footsteps we must follow, called the man who betrayed him his friend, and gave up of his own accord to his executioners. Therefore, our friends are those who for no reason cause us trouble and suffering, shame or injury, pain or torture, even martyrdom and death. It is these we must love, and love very much, because for all they do to us we are given eternal life'" (134).
- b. Moses asserts that the "disconnect between the Francis of his own writings and the Francis of the early biographers" is evident through their choice of Scripture (211). While Bonaventure's Major Legend contains > 600 scriptural references and 13th and 14th C. documents contain thousands of scriptural allusions "[n]ot once did any of the early biographers of Francis allude to 2 lines of Scripture -- [Mt. 5.44 "love your enemies" or Mt. 5.9 "blessed are the peacemakers"] -- that meant so much to [Francis]" (212). Please note that Francis devoted entire Admonitions to each of these Biblical passages, #9, which is in the doctrinal part and #15, which is a commentary on one of the beatitudes. Admonition 9. Of Love. "The Lord says in the Gospel, 'Love your enemies' (Mt 5.44). He truly loves his enemy who does not grieve because of the wrong done to himself, but who is afflicted for love of God because of the sin on his [brother's] soul and who shows his love by his works." Admonition 15. Of Peacemakers. "'Blessed are the peacemakers (Mt 5.9): for they shall be called the children of God.' They are truly peacemakers who amidst all they suffer in this world maintain peace in soul and body for the love of our Lord Jesus Christ."

Notes for Question 15.

a. "If we are going to understand Francis's transition from warrior to peacemaker, we must consider
the uncomfortable notion that Francis killed men on the battlefield. No one can say for sure if
Francis slew the enemy, but it is likely that he did. His eventual decision to begin a life of penance

÷ . 1

- (which will be addressed in a later chapter) hints that he believed he had sinned seriously on the battlefield." (22)
- b. "For the rest of his life, Francis was thoroughly convinced of his own sinfulness, much to the amazement of those who admired his holiness. He had made a decision "to embark upon a life of penance," he wrote in his last days. The reason could well be that he had killed in behalf of an unjust cause, and knew it." (24)

Notes for Question 16.

- a. Moses cites Father Cusato to argue that "the prayer Francis penned resembled the Muslim meditation on the Ninety-Nine Most Beautiful Names of God." Moses concludes that "Francis [was] evidently affected by prayers he learned about while in the East." (182).
- b. Again, citing Cusato, Moses asserts that "the face Francis drew on the parchment represented none other than Sultan Malik al-Kamil. The bearded figure appears to be wearing a turban, and the map of Egypt appears to be behind him, the northern coastline slanting upward toward Jerusalem. As Father Cusato noted, the 'talking head' was not uncommon in vernacular medieval literature (184).
- c. Moses concludes: "The parchment, then, is less a blessing for Brother Leo than a heartfelt prayer for God to protect Sultan al-Kamil and bring him peace. ... The drawing ..., as [u]sed here, may well be a call for the sultan to receive God's protection, possibly by converting to Christianity to avoid a new Crusade" (184).